

To: Board of Directors

Date: July 9, 2013

From: Laramie Bowron, Manager of Planning

Reviewed by:

---

### **Subject: Proposed Service Cuts in Light of the Transit Performance Initiative**

---

#### **Background:**

Staff is proposing minor cuts to the least productive routes to improve productivity. The Operations and Scheduling Committee reviewed the minor cuts in May and recommended Board approval. Action was delayed until after Board approval of the Title VI policy which defined Major Service Changes and until a Minor Service Change Policy was developed.

#### **Summary of Issues:**

In 2010 the Metropolitan Transportation Commission (MTC) launched the Transit Sustainability Project (TSP), a regional study designed to improve the financial condition of transit agencies by containing costs and using fare revenue to cover greater percentages of operating and capital costs.

Last year MTC adopted the TSP recommendations, which included the Transit Performance Initiative (TPI). The TPI is a new funding program rewarding transit agencies that improve ridership and service productivity.

MTC has programmed \$60 million for the TPI over a 4 year period based on the following criteria:

- Year 1(FY13): \$15 million distributed based on annual ridership
- Years 2-4 (FY14-16): 15% of the remaining \$45 million is allocated to small operators based on the following formula:
  - 25% based on passenger increase,
  - 25% based on passenger per hour increase, and
  - 50% for annual passengers.

Using this formula, County Connection was allocated \$103,901 in year 1 and \$335,268 in each of years 2, 3 and 4.

Moving forward, the draft *PlanBayArea*, MTC's long-range plan, dedicates \$500 million to the TPI. Although these funds have not been specified, programmed or committed, the TPI will likely be funded from existing funds rather than new revenue. The draft *PlanBayArea* illustrates a regional focus on productivity and a commitment to the TSP and the TPI.

With this in mind, staff analyzed the implications of cutting unproductive service and selected trips that met the following criteria:

- Routes with high TDA/STA subsidy per passenger (see attached ranking)
- Trips that averaged less than 4 boardings, and
- Trips that that maximized savings and productivity.

The following charts show the current schedules for Routes #2, #5, and #25 along with average boarding data from the Winter bid period. Trips recommended for cut are shown.

Since most of the unproductive service occurs in the mid-day time period and the routes selected all operate out of the Walnut Creek BART station, staff is able to reduce the number of vehicles by interlining routes that terminate there. It should be noted that the Trotter neighborhood served by Route 2 was selected for analysis as part of the ongoing Adaptive Service Plan designed to maximize productivity and cost-efficiency by identifying and implementing service better tailored to the community's needs.

Route 2 South: Walnut Creek BART - Trotter		
Change	Time	Avg. Boardings
	6:25 AM	1
	7:10 AM	4
	7:55 AM	5
<b>Cut</b>	<b>8:40 AM</b>	<b>2</b>
<b>Cut</b>	<b>9:40 AM</b>	<b>2</b>
<b>Add</b>	<b>10:00 AM</b>	<b>New</b>
<b>Cut</b>	<b>11:10 AM</b>	<b>2</b>
	12:40 PM	6
	2:10 PM	4
	3:40 PM	8
	4:40 PM	5
	5:25 PM	6
	6:10 PM	5
<b>Cut</b>	<b>6:55 PM</b>	<b>2</b>

Route 2 North: Trotter - Walnut Creek BART		
Change	Time	Avg. Boardings
	6:39 AM	4
	7:24 AM	6
	8:09 AM	4
<b>Cut</b>	<b>8:54 AM</b>	<b>2</b>
<b>Cut</b>	<b>9:54 AM</b>	<b>2</b>
<b>Add</b>	<b>10:16 AM</b>	<b>New</b>
<b>Cut</b>	<b>11:24 AM</b>	<b>1</b>
	12:54 PM	1
	2:24 PM	2
	3:54 PM	1
	4:54 PM	2
	5:39 PM	3
	6:24 PM	2
<b>Cut</b>	<b>7:09 PM</b>	<b>0</b>

Route 5 South: Walnut Creek BART - Creekside		
Change	Time	Avg. Boardings
	6:22 AM	5
	7:07 AM	3
	7:52 AM	3
	8:37 AM	4
<b>Cut</b>	<b>10:22 AM</b>	<b>4</b>
<b>Cut</b>	<b>11:52 AM</b>	<b>4</b>
	1:22 PM	5
	2:52 PM	7
	4:37 PM	7
	5:22 PM	6
	6:07 PM	5

Route 5 North: Creekside - Walnut Creek BART		
Change	Time	Avg. Boardings
	6:40 AM	4
	7:25 AM	7
	8:10 AM	4
	8:55 AM	2
<b>Cut</b>	<b>10:40 AM</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>Cut</b>	<b>12:10 PM</b>	<b>2</b>
	1:40 PM	1
	3:10 PM	4
	3:40 PM	3
	4:55 PM	2
	5:40 PM	1
	6:25 PM	0

Route 25 East: Lafayette BART - Walnut Creek BART		
Change	Time	Avg. Boardings
	7:30 AM	5
	8:30 AM	3
	9:30 AM	2
<b>Cut</b>	<b>10:30 AM</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>Add</b>	<b>11:20 AM</b>	<b>New</b>
<b>Cut</b>	<b>11:30 AM</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>Cut</b>	<b>12:30 PM</b>	<b>2</b>
	1:30 PM	4
	2:30 PM	2
	3:30 PM	6
	4:30 PM	5
	5:30 PM	5
	6:30 PM	5

Route 25 West: Walnut Creek BART - Lafayette BART		
Change	Time	Avg. Boardings
	8:00 AM	4
	9:00 AM	5
<b>Cut</b>	<b>10:00 AM</b>	<b>2</b>
<b>Add</b>	<b>10:50 AM</b>	<b>New</b>
<b>Cut</b>	<b>11:00 AM</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>Cut</b>	<b>12:00 PM</b>	<b>2</b>
	1:00 PM	6
	2:00 PM	2
	3:00 PM	2
	4:00 PM	3
	5:00 PM	4
	6:00 PM	2

Because the volume of service being cut is only 3% of the total, significant improvement at the route level has a small effect on overall productivity. In addition to productivity gains, staff anticipates these change would save nearly \$150,000 in annual operating cost.

These cuts do not cross the major service change threshold requiring a Title VI analysis.

Current vs. Proposed Productivity *(based on February actual data)*

Route	Current			Proposed	
	Revenue Hours	Ridership	Pass/RevHr	Revenue Hours	Pass/RevHr
2	178	1,193	6.70	153	7.81
5	200	1,641	8.21	162	10.11
25	230	1,156	5.02	191	6.05
System	17,003	268,666	15.80	16,644.48	16.29

**Recommendation:**

Staff recommends that the Board support the service cuts listed to improve productivity and respond to ridership patterns.

**Options:**

1. Approve the service changes as presented
2. Differ discussion to a later date
3. Other

**Attachments**

1. FY12 Subsidy per Passenger Ranking

**County Connection Subsidy per Passenger Ranking - FY12**

<b>Route</b>	<b>Annual Passengers</b>	<b>Cost (\$49.72/Total Hr + \$2.14/Total Mi)</b>	<b>Fares (\$1.51/Pass)</b>	<b>Contract, Measure J, and other revenue</b>	<b>TDA/STA</b>	<b>TDA/STA Subsidy/Pass</b>
649	147	\$25,149	\$221	\$24,928	\$0	\$0.00
316	27,747	\$149,905	\$41,898	\$107,517	\$491	\$0.02
92X	42,472	\$379,993	\$64,132	\$314,802	\$1,060	\$0.02
14	154,772	\$674,949	\$233,706	\$435,203	\$6,040	\$0.04
98X	84,885	\$633,630	\$128,177	\$493,175	\$12,278	\$0.14
18	109,541	\$621,312	\$165,407	\$435,203	\$20,702	\$0.19
16	176,189	\$993,750	\$266,045	\$688,902	\$38,803	\$0.22
9	142,126	\$787,368	\$214,610	\$525,994	\$46,764	\$0.33
627	12,063	\$23,920	\$18,215		\$5,705	\$0.47
613	5,693	\$12,055	\$8,596		\$3,459	\$0.61
93X	51,525	\$531,994	\$77,803	\$418,821	\$35,370	\$0.69
97X	23,863	\$406,212	\$14,575	\$368,663	\$22,975	\$0.96
96X	122,356	\$986,387	\$52,320	\$801,388	\$132,680	\$1.08
4 (Weekend)	51,684	\$127,430	\$0	\$69,412	\$58,017	\$1.12
95X	44,316	\$362,786	\$66,917	\$244,312	\$51,557	\$1.16
91X	9,077	\$79,988	\$13,706	\$55,011	\$11,271	\$1.24
20	282,499	\$815,557	\$426,574		\$388,982	\$1.38
605	17,008	\$49,261	\$25,682		\$23,579	\$1.39
35	87,045	\$896,012	\$131,438	\$640,161	\$124,414	\$1.43
10	249,890	\$770,033	\$377,334		\$392,699	\$1.57
310	34,037	\$107,204	\$51,397		\$55,807	\$1.64
611	9,216	\$29,339	\$13,917		\$15,423	\$1.67
314	60,877	\$209,899	\$91,925		\$117,974	\$1.94
614	8,683	\$30,194	\$13,111		\$17,082	\$1.97
4	231,578	\$595,637	\$0	\$138,824	\$456,813	\$1.97
623	8,813	\$31,836	\$13,308		\$18,528	\$2.10
615	4,549	\$17,508	\$6,869		\$10,639	\$2.34
602	24,195	\$98,355	\$36,535		\$61,820	\$2.56
619	4,065	\$17,541	\$6,139		\$11,402	\$2.80
601	21,013	\$93,682	\$31,729		\$61,953	\$2.95
320	19,525	\$87,757	\$29,483		\$58,273	\$2.98
11	75,333	\$341,515	\$113,753		\$227,762	\$3.02
15	119,247	\$595,075	\$180,063		\$415,012	\$3.48
612	5,544	\$29,111	\$8,372		\$20,739	\$3.74
636	15,730	\$86,530	\$23,752		\$62,778	\$3.99
606	51,171	\$284,327	\$77,268		\$207,059	\$4.05
622	5,155	\$28,929	\$7,784		\$21,145	\$4.10
311	20,711	\$124,283	\$31,273		\$93,010	\$4.49
17	55,546	\$340,120	\$83,875		\$256,245	\$4.61
1	92,552	\$481,897	\$221		\$481,676	\$5.20
6	106,432	\$733,129	\$160,713		\$572,416	\$5.38
625	7,125	\$49,169	\$10,759		\$38,410	\$5.39
21	151,734	\$1,078,575	\$229,119		\$849,456	\$5.60
321	22,162	\$165,467	\$33,465		\$132,002	\$5.96
19	35,258	\$264,998	\$53,239		\$211,758	\$6.01
6 (Weekend)	11,133	\$85,774	\$16,811		\$68,963	\$6.19
315	6,343	\$53,071	\$9,577		\$43,494	\$6.86
28	71,106	\$621,295	\$107,370		\$513,924	\$7.23
609	2,159	\$19,080	\$3,259		\$15,821	\$7.33
301	7,094	\$69,173	\$10,712		\$58,461	\$8.24
616	3,443	\$34,129	\$5,199		\$28,930	\$8.40
635	2,854	\$28,343	\$4,309		\$24,034	\$8.42
608	2,636	\$27,232	\$3,981		\$23,251	\$8.82
36	61,109	\$653,302	\$92,275		\$561,027	\$9.18
7	56,936	\$662,043	\$85,974		\$576,069	\$10.12
<b>5</b>	<b>15,724</b>	<b>\$191,284</b>	<b>\$23,744</b>		<b>\$167,540</b>	<b>\$10.65</b>
603	4,133	\$51,723	\$6,240		\$45,483	\$11.01
626	4,937	\$61,886	\$7,455		\$54,431	\$11.03
610	2,740	\$34,780	\$4,137		\$30,643	\$11.19
<b>2</b>	<b>15,246</b>	<b>\$206,207</b>	<b>\$23,022</b>		<b>\$183,186</b>	<b>\$12.02</b>
<b>25</b>	<b>14,188</b>	<b>\$232,729</b>	<b>\$21,423</b>		<b>\$211,306</b>	<b>\$14.89</b>
<b>GRAND TOTAL</b>	<b>3,166,932</b>	<b>\$18,281,820</b>	<b>\$4,060,911</b>	<b>\$5,762,317</b>	<b>\$8,458,592</b>	<b>\$2.67</b>